IMPROVING EQUITY IN FACULTY RECRUITING

Malcolm Finney, Kirsty Fleming and Bradley Pan-Weisz
OUR GOAL

Identify obstacles to attracting and selecting the most qualified candidates for your departments

Describe strategies to overcome these obstacles
ACTIVITY

Identifying places in the search process at which inequities can occur and steps to mitigate against these inequities
ROAD MAP

**Module 1**: Equity and quality candidates

**Module 2**: Unintentional bias as a barrier to attaining equity

**Module 3**: Mitigating the influence of unintentional bias
MODULE 1

Equity and high-quality candidates
BEACH 2030 VALUES & PRIORITIES: UNIVERSITY VALUES

• University Values

  ➢ **Compassion, creativity, and innovation** characterize our culture.
  ➢ **Diversity** is our strength.
  ➢ The **public good** is our responsibility.

• University Strategic Priorities: #4 - Build Community:

  ➢ **Be a model** of a diverse and respectful community of students, faculty, staff, alumni, and administrators.
  ➢ **Foster a community of belonging** where everyone’s voice and well-being are valued.
WHAT IS “EQUITY”? 

“One Equity” is equality of opportunity

Equality of opportunity is threatened by bias
WHAT DO WE MEAN BY “BIAS”? 

Any factor that tends to lead to unfair treatment 

(1) **Structural** 
   - Policies with disparate impacts 
   - History 

(2) **Psychological** *(what’s going on in someone’s head)* 
   - Intentional 
   - Unintentional
WHAT DO WE MEAN BY “BIAS”?  

Any factor that tends to lead to unfair treatment

(1) **Structural**
   - Policies with disparate impacts
   - History

(2) **Psychological** (what’s going on in someone’s head)
   - Intentional
   - Unintentional
Activity:

On a sheet of paper, answer the following questions

1. For every $100 in **wealth** accumulated by an average White family, how much wealth has the average Black family accumulated?

2. For every $100 **earned** by an average White family, how much do you think is earned by an average Black family?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wealth Income</th>
<th>$0</th>
<th>$20</th>
<th>$40</th>
<th>$60</th>
<th>$80</th>
<th>$100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Activity:

On a sheet of paper, answer the following questions

1. For every $100 in **wealth** accumulated by an average White family, how much wealth has the average Black family accumulated?

2. For every $100 **earned** by an average White family, how much do you think is earned by an average Black family?
STRUCTURAL BIAS

• Historically, policies have had disparate impacts on different groups, resulting in differential access to resources, power, and privilege.

• Racial inequity stems from long-standing systems, structures, and policies that have provided or denied access to resources, power, and privilege based on skin color and racial characterization.

• Essential for institutions to examine personal and structural biases that prevent them from reaching their fullest potential.
PSYCHOLOGICAL BIAS

• Unintentional Assumptions/Bias (Entering Mentoring, pp. 73-76):
  
  “Prejudice in favor of or against one thing, person, or group compared with another usually in a way that’s considered to be unfair. Biases may be held by an individual, group, or institution and can have negative or positive consequences” (UCSF Office of Diversity & Outreach)

• Hardwired; Generally Universal; Mental Shortcuts
• Brain is hardwired to see things in a certain way
127 faculty evaluated graduate-school-bound male or female student

Moss-Racusin et al. (2012)
% OF FULL PROFESSORS IN DEGREE-GRANTING INSTITUTIONS

• (CHE Article: (Are You Just Paying Lip Service to Diversity Hiring?))

• According to the National Center for Education Statistics, as of the fall of 2016, 83 percent of the full professors in degree-granting postsecondary institutions were white — 55 percent of them men and 27 percent women. Ten percent were Asian/Pacific Islanders, 4 percent were black, and 3 percent were Hispanic. While those proportions have crept up over the years, they have lagged behind the growing number of nonwhite students in American colleges.
Module 1 Conclusion

• Research shows there are tangible negative outcomes on some groups that result from both structural and psychological bias.

• We saw examples of how income, wealth, likelihood of securing a job, and salary were impacted based on gender or ethnicity.

• Additionally, these are not the only domains affected or the only groups affected by bias.
MODULE 2
Unintentional bias
Prejudicial Attitudes on the Decline

General Attitudes Toward Black and White Students Attending the Same School (by Percentage), 1956–2007

If your party nominated a woman for president, would you vote for her if she seemed qualified for the job?

Are Declining Prejudicial Attitudes Coinciding with Better Outcomes?

Racial Wealth Inequality Is Rampant In The U.S.
Median household wealth by race/ethnicity in the United States (1983–2024)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Latino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>$102,200</td>
<td>$6,800</td>
<td>$4,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>$122,366</td>
<td>$10,400</td>
<td>$10,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>$161,400</td>
<td>$1,633</td>
<td>$1,233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>$122,366</td>
<td>$1,633</td>
<td>$1,233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>$122,366</td>
<td>$1,633</td>
<td>$1,233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2024</td>
<td>$122,366</td>
<td>$1,633</td>
<td>$1,233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Forecast

Source: Prosperity Now & Institute For Policy Studies

The Gender Pay Gap Visualized
Gender pay gaps and equal pay days for different races and ethnicities in the U.S.

For every dollar white, non-Hispanic men earned in 2018, women were paid...

- Asian women: 85 cents
- Black women: 61 cents
- Native American women: 58 cents
- Latina women: 53 cents
- Women overall*: 80 cents
- White non-Hispanic women: 77 cents

To earn what white, non-Hispanic men earned in 2018, they would have to work until...

- Jan
- Feb
- Mar
- Apr 19, 2019
- May
- Jun
- Jul
- Aug 22, 2019
- Aug
- Sep
- Oct
- Nov
- Nov 20, 2019

* compared to men overall
Based on median annual earnings of full-time, year-round workers
Sources: National Women’s Law Center, Wikimedia Commons
At a societal level, despite declining negative attitudes toward minority groups, disparities in outcomes remain relatively stable.

Suggests disconnect between conscious attitudes and behavior.

Can a similar effect emerge for individual people?
The Implicit Association Task
Discuss

• With someone sitting next to you, please discuss your experience while completing the IAT.
  • Did you find certain trials more difficult than others?
  • If so, how does that make you feel?
Implicit Association Task

• Sheds light on which concepts are culturally associated

• Easier to respond when concepts that are culturally associated are paired together
  • Faster to respond
  • Fewer mistakes

You can take a variety of different IATs online with Project Implicit

https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html
Implicit Association Task

How do people score on the Race IAT?

Number of Participants

(more pro-Black)  IAT Score  (more pro-White)

Implicit Preference
- Pro-Black Preference
- No Preference
- Pro-White Preference
Implicit Association Task

How do people score on the Gender-Science IAT?

- Implicit Association
  - Female--Science Association
  - No Gender--Science Association
  - Male--Science Association

Number of Participants

(Stronger female-science association)  IAT Score  (Stronger male-science association)
Implicit Association Task

How do people score on the Age IAT?

- Implicit Preference
  - Pro-Old Preference
  - No Age Preference
  - Pro-Young Preference

Number of Participants

(more pro-old)  IAT Score  (more pro-young)
Implicit Association Task

• IAT is a measure of unconscious cultural associations
• Associations are learned from repeated co-occurrence of two concepts in our culture
• Associations can exist despite conscious rejection of group stereotypes
At the individual level, despite conscious rejection of stereotypes, decisions and behavior can be driven by unconscious cultural associations.
Two Systems of Thinking: Fast and Slow

System 1: Fast
- Unconscious
- Automatic
- Unintentional Thinking

System 2: Slow
- Conscious
- Effortful
- Intentional Thinking

Both forms can drive behavior and decisions.
Two Systems of Thinking: Fast and Slow

System 2: Slow
Conscious, Effortful, Intentional Thinking

System 1: Fast
Unconscious, Automatic, Unintentional Thinking

Both forms can drive behavior and decisions
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Devine (1989)
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Unconscious Awareness of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Conscious Rejection of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Devine (1989)
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

When people are made aware that they responded in a biased manner

Unconscious Awareness of Negative Group
Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Unintentional Bias

Devine (1989)

- Feelings of guilt
- Become motivated to examine the situation to prevent it in the future
The human brain is hardwired to be as efficient as possible.

Often, relying on heuristics and intuition—often successful, but can lead to errors (bias)

Our conscious mind can correct errors (bias), but requires attention, time, and effort
What are the consequences of Unintentional Bias?
Real companies evaluating white and black job applicants

127 faculty evaluated graduate-school-bound male or female student

Moss-Racusin et al. (2012)
Consequences

Aversive Prejudice
Aversive Prejudice

- This study was conducted twice—once in 1989, once in 1999.
- In both studies, white participants were asked about their explicit attitudes towards African Americans.
- Asked undergraduates to determine if candidates for a position to be a peer counselor should be recommended for the job.
- Researchers varied the qualifications of the candidate, and whether the candidate was white or black.

Dovidio & Gaertner (2000)
Aversive Prejudice

Negative Attitudes toward African Americans

Year

1989

1999

Dovidio & Gaertner (2000)
Aversive Prejudice

Percent Recommended for Job

Weak | Ambiguous | Strong

1989

White  Black

1999

White  Black

Job Qualifications

Weak | Ambiguous | Strong

Dovidio & Gaertner (2000)
Aversive Prejudice in Action

- 6500 faculty received an email from a supposed student inquiring about research opportunities before applying to doctoral programs.
  - Email requested to meet in person the following week for 10 minutes
- Students’ names varied by race and gender.
- Measured whether or not professor responded within a week.

Milkman et al. (2015)
Subject Line: Prospective Doctoral Student (On Campus Today/[Next Monday])

Dear Professor [surname of professor inserted here],

I am writing you because I am a prospective doctoral student with considerable interest in your research. My plan is to apply to doctoral programs this coming Fall, and I am eager to learn as much as I can about research opportunities in the meantime.

I will be on campus today/[next Monday], and although I know it is short notice, I was wondering if you might have 10 minutes when you would be willing to meet with me to briefly talk about your work and any possible opportunities for me to get involved in your research. Any time that would be convenient for you would be fine with me, as meeting with you is my first priority during this campus visit.

Thank you in advance for your consideration.
Sincerely,

[Student’s full name inserted here]
Aversive Prejudice in Action

• 6500 faculty received an email from a supposed student inquiring about research opportunities before applying to doctoral programs.
  • Email requested to meet in person the following week for 10 minutes
• Students’ names varied by race and gender.
• Measured whether or not professor responded within a week.

• Results: Faculty were significantly more responsive to white, male students compared to all other groups.
  • Did not vary by department’s representation of ethnic minorites or women
  • No benefit from contacting same-race or same-gender professor

Milkman et al. (2015)
Case Study Activity

Please take a few minutes to read through the transcript, and then try to identify where unintentional bias may have crept into this committee’s final deliberations.
Consequences

Reconstruction of credentials
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

• How important is being formally educated for a police chief job?

• Should this person get hired?

Uhlmann & Cohen (2005)
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

- Gender of Applicant
  - “Michelle”
  - “Michael”

- Credentials of Applicant
  - “Michelle”
    - Streetwise
    - Formally Educated
  - “Michael”
    - Streetwise
    - Formally Educated

- How important is being formally educated for a police chief job? **Very important**
- Should this person get hired? **No**

Uhlmann & Cohen (2005)
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

Gender of Applicant

“Michelle”

Credentials of Applicant

Streetwise

Formally Educated

“Michael”

Credentials of Applicant

Streetwise

Formally Educated

• How important is being formally educated for a police chief job? Not very important

• Should this person get hired? No

Uhlmann & Cohen (2005)
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

• How important is being formally educated for a police chief job? Not very important

• Should this person get hired? Yes

Uhlmann & Cohen (2005)
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

Gender of Applicant

“Michelle”
- Streetwise
- Formally Educated

“Michael”
- Streetwise
- Formally Educated

- How important is being formally educated for a police chief job? **Very important**
- Should this person get hired? **Yes**

Uhlmann & Cohen (2005)
Reconstruction of Credentials: Police Chief

- This gender bias significantly stronger for participants who perceived themselves to be objective
- Gender bias was **eliminated** if participants rated importance of job criteria before seeing applicants

---

Hiring committees that don’t believe in gender bias promote fewer women

**Hiring committees that don’t believe in gender bias promote fewer women**

Credit: Sebastian Herrmann/Unsplash

**ARTS & HUMANITIES**

Aug 26, 2019  |  For more information, contact Erik Rolfsen

Unintentional bias can lead to inequity—unfair preference for certain group members.

Like other habits, unintentional bias can be overcome—but requires conscious effort.

Researchers have identified evidence-based strategies for reducing unintentional bias.
Break time!
MODULE 3

Mitigating unintentional bias
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Unconscious, Automatic, Unintentional Thinking

Conscious, Effortful, Intentional Thinking
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

What does it take to stop a bad habit?

(1) being motivated to change the habit

(2) being aware of when the habitual behavior occurs

(3) learning strategies to reduce the habitual behavior

(4) putting in effort using those strategies
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Devine (1989)
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

To reduce unintended bias, you must:

1. be **motivated** to address the bias

2. be **aware** of when the bias occurs

3. learn **strategies** to reduce the bias

4. put in **effort** using those strategies

Devine et al. (2012)
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Unconscious Awareness of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Conscious Rejection of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Devine (1989)
Unintentional Bias as a Habit of Mind

Unconscious Awareness of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Conscious Rejection of Negative Group Stereotypes and/or Cultural Associations

Devine (1989)
Ineffective strategies for combating unintentional bias
Stereotype suppression
Just don’t think about stereotypes

Colorblindness and Genderblindness
Claiming to not see race, or gender

Belief in personal objectivity
An inordinate belief that your decisions are objective

Macrae et al. (1994); Plaut et al. (2009); Uhlmann & Cohen (2007)
Effective strategies for combating unintentional bias
Tenure-Track Search Process

1. **Request for Tenure-Track Position**
2. **Search Committee Makes Recommendation for Appointment**
3. **On-Campus Interviews**
4. **Screening for Desired/Preferred Qualifications**
5. **Phone Interviews and Selection of Finalists**
6. **Recruitment and Advertising Plan**
7. **The Position Description**
8. **The Search Committee**

The cycle starts with a request for a tenure-track position, followed by the search committee making a recommendation for appointment. This leads to on-campus interviews, screening based on desired/preferred qualifications, and phone interviews, resulting in the selection of finalists. The recruitment and advertising plan are then developed, followed by the preparation of the position description, and finally, the search committee convenes.
STEREOTYPE REPLACEMENT

Replace stereotypical responses with non-stereotypical responses

Monteith (1993)
Imagine, in detail, counter-stereotypical others
SEEK INDIVIDUATING INFORMATION

Seek out information about what makes a person unique

Brewer (1988); Fiske & Neuberg (1990)
Imagine in the first person what it would feel like to be in another person’s situation
INCREASE OPPORTUNITIES FOR CONTACT

Actively seek out situations that will allow you to experience positive interactions with people who are different from you.

Pettigrew & Tropp (2006)
Effective Strategies for Combating Unintentional Bias

Stereotype replacement

Counter stereotypic imagining

Seek individuating information

Perspective-take

Increase opportunities for positive contact

How might one be able to use these strategies in the various stages of a tenure-track search?
Effective Strategies for Combating Unintentional Bias

• **Review of files/selection of semi-finalists**
  o Commit to the qualifications you will use to evaluate your candidates
  o Determine the evidence you will use to decide your qualifications are met
  o Adhere to your weighting of your qualifications
  o Consider the order in which materials are reviewed
  o Review document by document or qualification by qualification
  o Conduct a blind review if possible
  o Take time reviewing the applications
Effective Strategies for Combating Unintentional Bias

- Semi-finalists interviews
- Selection of finalists
- On-campus interview
- Reference checks
- Search Committee recommendations and offer process

- Be self-aware
- Be a bystander
Effective Strategies for Combating Unintentional Bias

• Selecting the position you request
• Selecting the search committee
• Position description
  o Avoid using gendered words in the PD – use neutral words
  o Align the qualifications with RTP
  o Carefully consider the qualifications you will list
• Recruiting and Advertising plan
Questions?