

NO NOTES, BOOKS, ELECTRONIC DEVICES, OR INTERPERSONAL COMMUNICATION ALLOWED. Submit solutions to **AT MOST 6 PROBLEMS**. Please use **BOTH SIDES** of each answer sheet to save paper. Make sure your name and Class ID are on each answer sheet.

Problems (25 Points Each)

1. The base-3 representation of a natural number x is a sequence $\alpha_k\alpha_{k-1}\cdots\alpha_1\alpha_0$, where each $\alpha_i \in \{0, 1, 2\}$ and

$$x = \alpha_k 3^k + \alpha_{k-1} 3^{k-1} + \cdots + \alpha_1 3 + \alpha_0.$$

Note: this problem counts for passing LO5.

- (a) Let $\text{tern}(x, i)$ denote the i th ternary digit (i.e. α_i) of x . Use any known primitive recursive functions from the Models of Computation lecture to show that $\text{tern}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. (12 pts)
- (b) It can be shown that any number x can be written in ternary using exactly $\lfloor \log_3 x \rfloor + 1$ ternary digits. Show that this function is primitive recursive with the help of the least-satisfying function and the power function. (13 pts)
2. Answer/solve the following. Note: this problem counts for passing LO7.

- (a) When simulating the computation $P_x(y)$, why must universal URM program P_U know the amount of registers that P_x uses in its computations? Explain. (7 pts)
- (b) A universal program P_U is simulating a program that has 754 instructions and whose Gödel number is

$$x = 2^7 + 2^{23} + 2^{63} + 2^{71} + 2^{105} + 2^{141} + \cdots + 2^{c_{754}} - 1.$$

If the current configuration of the computation of P_x on some input has encoding

$$\sigma = 2^3 + 2^5 + 2^{10} + 2^{13} + 2^{16} - 1,$$

then provide the next configuration of the computation *and* its encoding. (18 pts)

3. Answer the following. Note: this problem counts for passing LO8.

- (a) Define what it means to be a positive instance of decision problem **Total**. (5 pts)
- (b) The goal is to show that **Total** is undecidable. We assume it is decidable by assuming that its characteristic function

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x \text{ is a positive instance of Total} \\ 0 & \text{if } x \text{ is a negative instance of Total} \end{cases}$$

is total computable. Provide the definition for how to compute the “antagonist” function $g(x)$ based on the value of $f(x)$. (8 pts)

- (c) By writing the values of $g(0), g(1), \dots$ in the appropriate cells, verify that function g is different from each computable function $\phi_i, i = 0, 1, \dots$, which is a contradiction since g is computable and thus should be equal to at least one of the function. (5 pts)

| index \ input x | 0 | 1 | 2 | \dots | i | \dots | total? |
|-----------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|------------|----------|----------|
| $\phi_0(x)$ | 2 | 12 | 7 | \dots | \uparrow | \dots | no |
| $\phi_1(x)$ | 8 | 87 | 36 | \dots | 96 | \dots | yes |
| $\phi_2(x)$ | 7 | 5 | 0 | \dots | \uparrow | \dots | no |
| \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \ddots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots |
| $\phi_i(x)$ | 0 | 32 | 65 | \dots | 5 | \dots | yes |
| \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \ddots | \vdots |

- (d) How can we be certain that $g(x) \neq \phi_2(x)$? (7 pts)

4. Solve the following.

- (a) Let $\text{MaxRegJump}(x, i)$ denote the maximum register index used by the i th instruction of P_x which we may assume is a Jump instruction. Show that $\text{MaxRegJump}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: you may use the fact that all encoding and decoding functions are primitive recursive. (12 pts)
- (b) Let $\text{IncrementComponent}(x, i)$ be the function that takes as input a tuple encoding x and a component index $1 \leq i \leq k(x)$, and outputs the encoding of the tuple

$$(a(1, x), \dots, a(i, x) + 1, \dots, a(k(x), x)).$$

Show that $\text{IncrementComponent}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: make use of the function $c(i, x)$, which gives the i th power-of-two exponent in the encoding of x . (13 pts)

5. Prove that both $\pi_1(z)$ and $\pi_2(z)$ are primitive recursive, where π_1 and π_2 satisfy the equation $\pi(\pi_1(z), \pi_2(z)) = z$. In other words, $\pi_i(z)$ returns the i th component of $\pi^{-1}(z)$, $i = 1, 2$. Note: solving this problem counts for passing LO5.

- (a) Show $\pi_1(z)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: it equals the largest power of 2 that can divide into $z + 1$. (15 pts)
- (b) Show that $\pi_2(z)$ is also primitive recursive. (10 pts)

6. Suppose P is a program that has 9 instructions, uses registers R_1, \dots, R_5 , and computes the function $f(u, v) = u \cdot v$. Write another program Q that makes use of P (as a block of instructions within Q) for computing the function x^y . Use the fact that x^y has the following recursive definition.

Base Case: $x^0 = 1$

Recursive Case: $x^{y+1} = x \cdot x^y$

Thus, your program should (non-recursively) implement the above recursive definition by making use of P within a `while` loop. Note: with the exception of the abstract P -block of instructions, all other instructions should be concrete. Hint: the P -block may be assigned a single instruction number (as opposed to 9 instructions).

- (a) Provide the instructions of URM program Q . (12 pts)
- (b) Write a paragraph that explains how your program works. (13 pts)

Learning Outcome Makeup Problems (0 Points Each)

LO1. Answer the following.

- (a) Provide the definition of what it means to be a mapping reduction from decision problem A to decision problem B . (10 pts)
- (b) Is $f(n) = 3n^2 + 7$ a valid mapping reduction from the **Even** decision problem to the **Odd** decision problem? Justify your answer.

LO2. An instance of the **Composite** decision problem is a natural number n , and the problem is to decide if n is composite, i.e. $n \geq 2$ and there is a number $2 \leq d < n$ that divides evenly into n .

- (a) For a given instance n of **Composite** describe a certificate in relation to n .
- (b) Provide a semi-formal verifier algorithm that takes as input i) an instance n , ii) a certificate for n as defined in part a, and decides if the certificate is valid for n .
- (c) Provide size parameters that may be used to measure the size of an instance of **Composite**.
- (d) Use the size parameters from part c to describe the running time of your verifier from part b. Defend your answer in relation to the algorithm you provided for the verifier. Hint: assume division of two k -bit numbers may be performed in $O(k^2)$ steps.

LO3. Recall the mapping reduction $f(\mathcal{C}) = (S, t)$, where f maps an instance of **3SAT** to an instance of the **Subset** decision problem. Given **3SAT** instance

$$\mathcal{C} = \{(x_1, \bar{x}_2, x_5), (x_2, x_3, \bar{x}_4), (x_1, x_2, x_4), (\bar{x}_1, \bar{x}_3, \bar{x}_5)\}$$

answer the following questions about $f(\mathcal{C})$. Hint: to answer these questions you are *not* required to draw the table.

- (a) What is the value of t ?
- (b) How many numbers (counting repeats) are in S ? What is the largest (in terms of numerical value) number in S ?
- (c) Determine a satisfying assignment for \mathcal{C} and use it to identify a subset of S that sums to t . List all the members of S . Hint: there are multiple possible answers, but the subset you choose must correspond with your chosen satisfying assignment.

LO4. Answer the following. Note: scoring 14 or more points counts for passing.

- (a) Write either P, NP, or co-NP next to each of the following decision problems in terms of which one best characterizes the complexity of the problem. Note: there is only one best answer for each. Two points each.
 - i. An instance of **Half Clique** is a graph $G = (V, E)$ and the problem is to decide if G has a clique of size $|V|/2$.
 - ii. An instance of **Set Cover (SC)** is a triple (\mathcal{S}, m, k) , where $\mathcal{S} = \{S_1, \dots, S_n\}$ is a collection of n subsets, where $S_i \subseteq \{1, \dots, m\}$, for each $i = 1, \dots, n$, and a nonnegative integer k . The problem is to decide if there are k subsets S_{i_1}, \dots, S_{i_k} for which

$$S_{i_1} \cup \dots \cup S_{i_k} = \{1, \dots, m\}.$$

- iii. An instance of UNSAT is a Boolean formula F and the problem is to decide if F is unsatisfiable, meaning that F cannot be satisfied by any assignment over its variables.
 - iv. An instance of the **Composite** decision problem is a natural number n , and the problem is to decide if n is composite, i.e. $n \geq 2$ and there is a number $2 \leq d < n$ that divides evenly into n .
- (b) Based on mapping reductions from the Mapping Reducibility and Computational Complexity lectures, the three polynomial-time mapping reductions $A \leq_m^p B$, $B \leq_m^p C$, and $C \leq_m^p \text{Traveling Salesperson}$ establish that **Traveling Salesperson** is an NP-complete problem. Provide the specific names of decision problems A , B , and C . Hint: A does *not* equal SAT. (3 points each)
- (c) Which of the following decision problems is *not* P? (9 points)
- i. 2SAT
 - ii. Composite
 - iii. Set Partition
 - iv. Prime

LO6. Answer and solve the following.

- (a) Compute the Gödel number for program $P = T(3, 2), J(1, 2, 3), Z(3), S(6)$. Write your answer as a sum of powers of two minus 1.
- (b) Provide the instructions of the program whose Gödel number is

$$x = 2^4 + 2^{14} + 2^{301} + 2^{381} - 1.$$

Solutions to 25-Point Problems

1. The base-3 representation of a natural number x is a sequence $\alpha_k\alpha_{k-1}\cdots\alpha_1\alpha_0$, where each $\alpha_i \in \{0, 1, 2\}$ and

$$x = \alpha_k 3^k + \alpha_{k-1} 3^{k-1} + \cdots + \alpha_1 3 + \alpha_0.$$

Note: this problem counts for passing LO5.

- (a) Let $\text{tern}(x, i)$ denote the i th ternary digit (i.e. α_i) of x . Use any known primitive recursive functions from the Models of Computation lecture to show that $\text{tern}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. (12 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\text{tern}(x, i) = (x/3^i) \bmod 3.$$

- (b) It can be shown that any number x can be written in ternary using exactly $\lfloor \log_3 x \rfloor + 1$ ternary digits. Show that this function is primitive recursive with the help of the least-satisfying function and the power function. (13 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\lfloor \log_3 x \rfloor + 1 = \left[\lambda_{z \leq x} (3^z > x) \right] - 1.$$

2. Answer/solve the following. Note: this problem counts for passing LO7.

- (a) When simulating the computation $P_x(y)$, why must universal URM program P_U know the amount of registers that P_x uses in its computations? Explain. (7 pts)

Solution. P_U know the amount of registers used by P_x in order to properly encode each configuration of the computation of P_x on input y , since the configuration is a vector whose number of components equals one more than the number of registers used by P_x .

- (b) A universal program P_U is simulating a program that has 754 instructions and whose Gödel number is

$$x = 2^7 + 2^{23} + 2^{63} + 2^{71} + 2^{105} + 2^{141} + \cdots + 2^{c_{754}} - 1.$$

If the current configuration of the computation of P_x on some input has encoding

$$\sigma = 2^3 + 2^5 + 2^{10} + 2^{13} + 2^{16} - 1,$$

then provide the next configuration of the computation *and* its encoding. (18 pts)

Solution.

$$c = \tau^{-1}(\sigma) = (3, 1, 4, 2, 2).$$

Also, $\beta(I_2) = 15$ and $15 \bmod 4 = 3$ implies that I_2 is a jump instruction $J(i, j, k)$, where $\xi(i-1, j-1, k-1) = 3 = (15-3)/4$. Finally, to get $\xi^{-1}(3)$ we see that

$$3 + 1 = 4 = 2^2(2(0) + 1),$$

and $\pi^{-1}(2) = (0, 1)$ to give $\beta^{-1}(15) = J(1, 2, 1)$. Therefore,

$$c_{\text{next}} = (3, 1, 4, 2, 3)$$

and

$$\tau(c_{\text{next}}) = 2^3 + 2^5 + 2^{10} + 2^{13} + 2^{17} - 1.$$

3. Answer the following. Note: this problem counts for passing LO8.

- (a) Define what it means to be a positive instance of decision problem **Total**. (5 pts)

Solution. See Section 3.1 of the Undecidability and Diagonalization Method lecture.

- (b) The goal is to show that **Total** is undecidable. We assume it is decidable by assuming that its characteristic function

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x \text{ is a positive instance of Total} \\ 0 & \text{if } x \text{ is a negative instance of Total} \end{cases}$$

is total computable. Provide the definition for how to compute the “antagonist” function $g(x)$ based on the value of $f(x)$. (8 pts)

Solution. See Section 3.1 of the Undecidability and Diagonalization Method lecture (but $f(x)$ instead of $g(x)$ since the function roles have been reversed).

- (c) By writing the values of $g(0), g(1), \dots$ in the appropriate cells, verify that function g is different from each computable function $\phi_i, i = 0, 1, \dots$, which is a contradiction since g is computable and thus should be equal to at least one of the function. (5 pts)

Solution. The values of $g(x)$ are in red and show that g differs from all computable functions ϕ along the diagonal, except for those ϕ_x which are not total and for which $\phi_x(x) = 0$. See part c) for an explanation as to why $g(x)$ is different from these functions.

| index \ input x | 0 | 1 | 2 | \dots | i | \dots | total? |
|-----------------|-------------------|---------------------|-------------------|----------|-------------------|----------|---------------|
| $\phi_0(x)$ | 2 \rightarrow 0 | 12 | 7 | \dots | \uparrow | \dots | no |
| $\phi_1(x)$ | 8 | 87 \rightarrow 88 | 36 | \dots | 96 | \dots | yes |
| $\phi_2(x)$ | 7 | 5 | 0 \rightarrow 0 | \dots | \uparrow | \dots | no |
| \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \ddots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots |
| $\phi_i(x)$ | 0 | 32 | 65 | \dots | 5 \rightarrow 6 | \dots | yes |
| \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \vdots | \ddots | \vdots |

- (d) How can we be certain that $g(x) \neq \phi_2(x)$? (7 pts)

Solution. $g(x)$ is total but $\phi_2(x)$ is undefined on input i , and so the functions will disagree on input $x = i$.

4. Solve the following.

- (a) Let $\text{MaxRegJump}(x, i)$ denote the maximum register index used by the i th instruction of P_x which we may assume is a Jump instruction. Show that $\text{MaxRegJump}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: you may use the fact that all encoding and decoding functions are primitive recursive. (12 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\text{MaxRegJump}(x, i) = \text{Max}(\pi_1(\pi_1((a(i, x) - 3)/4)), \pi_2(\pi_1((a(i, x) - 3)/4))) + 1.$$

- (b) Let $\text{IncrementComponent}(x, i)$ be the function that takes as input a tuple encoding x and a component index $1 \leq i \leq k(x)$, and outputs the encoding of the tuple

$$(a(1, x), \dots, a(i, x) + 1, \dots, a(k(x), x)).$$

Show that $\text{IncrementComponent}(x, i)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: make use of the function $c(i, x)$, which gives the i th power-of-two exponent in the encoding of x . (13 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\text{IncrementComponent}(x, i) = \sum_{z=1}^{i-1} 2^{c(i, x)} + \sum_{z=i}^{k(x)} 2^{c(i, x)+1}.$$

5. Prove that both $\pi_1(z)$ and $\pi_2(z)$ are primitive recursive, where π_1 and π_2 satisfy the equation $\pi(\pi_1(z), \pi_2(z)) = z$. In other words, $\pi_i(z)$ returns the i th component of $\pi^{-1}(z)$, $i = 1, 2$. Note: solving this problem counts for passing LO5.

- (a) Show $\pi_1(z)$ is primitive recursive. Hint: it equals the largest power of 2 that can divide into $z + 1$. (15 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\pi_1(z) = \left[\lambda_{p \leq z+1} \overline{\text{Div}(z+1, 2^p)} \right] - 1.$$

- (b) Show that $\pi_2(z)$ is also primitive recursive. (10 pts)

Solution. We have

$$\pi_2(z) = (z + 1)/\pi_1(z).$$

6. Suppose P is a program that has 9 instructions, uses registers R_1, \dots, R_5 , and computes the function $f(u, v) = u \cdot v$. Write another program Q that makes use of P (as a block of instructions within Q) for computing the function x^y . Use the fact that x^y has the following recursive definition.

Base Case: $x^0 = 1$

Recursive Case: $x^{y+1} = x \cdot x^y$

Thus, your program should (non-recursively) implement the above recursive definition by making use of P within a `while` loop. Note: with the exception of the abstract P -block of instructions, all other instructions should be concrete. Hint: the P -block may be assigned a single instruction number (as opposed to 9 instructions).

- (a) Provide the instructions of URM program Q . (12 pts)

Solution.

1. $T(1, 6)$
 2. $T(2, 7)$
 3. $Z(2)$
 4. $S(2)$ //place 1 in R_2
 5. $J(7, 8, 14)$ //while the number of multiplications performed is $< y$
 6. P
 7. $T(1, 2)$
 8. $T(6, 1)$
 9. $Z(3)$
 10. $Z(4)$
 11. $Z(5)$
 12. $S(8)$
 13. $J(1, 1, 5)$
 14. $T(2, 1)$
- (b) Write a paragraph that explains how your program works. (13 pts)

Solution. The program uses a loop to successively compute

$$x \cdot 1, x \cdot x, x \cdot x^2, \dots, x \cdot x^{y-1} = x^y.$$

It uses program P to perform each multiplication. It first places x and y in safe registers R_6 and R_7 , respectively. It also uses R_8 to count up to y , the number of multiplications that must be performed. It then places 1 in R_2 and uses P to compute the initial product $x \cdot 1$. This result is then moved to R_2 in order to prepare for the next multiplication. Also, x is transferred to R_1 from R_6 . Furthermore, before the next use of P , registers R_3, R_4 , and R_5 must be cleared. Finally, after y multiplications, the result x^y is stored in R_1 as output.

Solutions to Learning Outcome Makeup Problems

LO1. Answer the following.

- (a) Provide the definition of what it means to be a mapping reduction from decision problem A to decision problem B . (10 pts)

Solution. See Definition 2.1 of Turing and Mapping Reducibility lecture.

- (b) Is $f(n) = 3n^2 + 7$ a valid mapping reduction from the Even decision problem to the Odd decision problem? Justify your answer.

Solution. This is a valid reduction since even number $2k$ maps to

$$12k^2 + 7 = 2(6k^2) + 2(3) + 1 = 2(6k^2 + 3) + 1,$$

which is odd, and odd number $2k + 1$ maps to

$$3(4k^2 + 4k + 1) + 7 = 12k^2 + 12k + 10 = 2(6k^2 + 6k + 5)$$

which is even.

LO2. An instance of the **Composite** decision problem is a natural number n , and the problem is to decide if n is composite, i.e. $n \geq 2$ and there is a number $2 \leq d < n$ that divides evenly into n .

(a) For a given instance n of **Composite** describe a certificate in relation to n .

Solution. A certificate is an integer c in the interval $[2, n - 1]$.

(b) Provide a semi-formal verifier algorithm that takes as input i) an instance n , ii) a certificate for n as defined in part a, and decides if the certificate is valid for n .

Solution. One line: Return $\text{Div}(n, c)$.

(c) Provide size parameters that may be used to measure the size of an instance of **Composite**.

Solution. The size of integer n is $\lceil \log n \rceil + 1$, i.e. the number of bits needed to represent n . So we use $\log n$ as a size parameter.

(d) Use the size parameters from part c to describe the running time of your verifier from part b. Defend your answer in relation to the algorithm you provided for the verifier. Hint: assume division of two k -bit numbers may be performed in $O(k^2)$ steps.

Solution. Since we must perform a single division and each one requires $O(\log^2 n)$ steps, the running time is $O(\log^2 n)$.

LO3. Recall the mapping reduction $f(\mathcal{C}) = (S, t)$, where f maps an instance of **3SAT** to an instance of the **Subset** decision problem. Given **3SAT** instance

$$\mathcal{C} = \{(x_1, \bar{x}_2, x_5), (x_2, x_3, \bar{x}_4), (x_1, x_2, x_4), (\bar{x}_1, \bar{x}_3, \bar{x}_5)\}$$

answer the following questions about $f(\mathcal{C})$. Hint: to answer these questions you are *not* required to draw the table.

(a) What is the value of t ?

Solution. $t = 111, 113, 333$

(b) How many numbers (counting repeats) are in S ? What is the largest (in terms of numerical value) number in S ?

Solution. We have $|S| = 2(m + n) = 2(4 + 5) = 18$. Largest value is $y_1 = 100, 001, 010$.

- (c) Determine a satisfying assignment for \mathcal{C} and use it to identify a subset of S that sums to t . List all the members of S . Hint: there are multiple possible answers, but the subset you choose must correspond with your chosen satisfying assignment.

Solution. Since $\alpha = (x_1 = 1, x_2 = 1, x_3 = 0, x_4 = 1, x_5 = 0)$ satisfies \mathcal{C} , a subset that sums to t is

$$A = \{y_1, y_2, z_3, y_4, z_5, g_1, h_1, g_2, h_2, g_4\}.$$

LO4. Answer the following. Note: scoring 14 or more points counts for passing.

- (a) Write either P, NP, or co-NP next to each of the following decision problems in terms of which one best characterizes the complexity of the problem. Note: there is only one best answer for each. Two points each.
- i. An instance of **Half Clique** is a graph $G = (V, E)$ and the problem is to decide if G has a clique of size $|V|/2$.
 - ii. An instance of **Set Cover (SC)** is a triple (\mathcal{S}, m, k) , where $\mathcal{S} = \{S_1, \dots, S_n\}$ is a collection of n subsets, where $S_i \subseteq \{1, \dots, m\}$, for each $i = 1, \dots, n$, and a nonnegative integer k . The problem is to decide if there are k subsets S_{i_1}, \dots, S_{i_k} for which

$$S_{i_1} \cup \dots \cup S_{i_k} = \{1, \dots, m\}.$$

- iii. An instance of **UNSAT** is a Boolean formula F and the problem is to decide if F is unsatisfiable, meaning that F cannot be satisfied by any assignment over its variables.
- iv. An instance of the **Composite** decision problem is a natural number n , and the problem is to decide if n is composite, i.e. $n \geq 2$ and there is a number $2 \leq d < n$ that divides evenly into n .

Solution. i) NP, ii) NP, iii) co-NP, iv) P

- (b) Based on mapping reductions from the Mapping Reducibility and Computational Complexity lectures, the three polynomial-time mapping reductions $A \leq_m^p B$, $B \leq_m^p C$, and $C \leq_m^p \text{Traveling Salesperson}$ establish that **Traveling Salesperson** is an NP-complete problem. Provide the specific names of decision problems A , B , and C . Hint: A does *not* equal SAT. (3 points each)

Solution. $A = \text{DHP}$, $B = \text{UHP}$, $C = \text{HC}$.

- (c) Which of the following decision problems is *not* P? (9 points)
- i. 2SAT
 - ii. Composite
 - iii. Set Partition
 - iv. Prime

Solution. Set Partition

LO6. Answer and solve the following.

- (a) Compute the Gödel number for program $P = T(3, 2), J(1, 2, 3), Z(3), S(6)$. Write your answer as a sum of powers of two minus 1.

Solution. We have

$$\gamma(P) = 2^{46} + 2^{226} + 2^{235} + 2^{247} - 1.$$

- (b) Provide the instructions of the program whose Gödel number is

$$x = 2^4 + 2^{14} + 2^{301} + 2^{381} - 1.$$

Solution. $P = Z(1), S(3), T(4, 5), J(1, 2, 3)$.